

2023-2031 Housing Element City of Palo Alto



Appendix A: Past Accomplishments



Table of Contents

APPENDIX A: PAST ACCOMPLISHMENTS

A.1 INTRODUCTION..... A-1

A.2 REVIEW OF PAST ACCOMPLISHMENTS..... A-2

TABLES

Table A-1 Quantified Housing Objective and
Achieved Accomplishments
(2015-2023) A-1

Table A-2 Review of Past Accomplishments..... A-2

APPENDIX A: PAST ACCOMPLISHMENTS

A

A.1 INTRODUCTION

To develop appropriate programs to address the housing issues identified in the 2023-2031 Housing Element, the City of Palo Alto has reviewed the housing programs adopted in the 2015-2023 Housing Element and evaluated the effectiveness of these programs in delivering housing services and assistance. Table A-1 summarizes the City’s progress toward the 5th cycle RHNA and Table A-2 provides a detailed program-level assessment of housing accomplishments over the last planning period. Programs that are routine staff functions, with no specific actions, or no direct city involvement are not proposed to be continued as housing programs.

TABLE A-1 QUANTIFIED HOUSING OBJECTIVE AND ACHIEVED ACCOMPLISHMENTS (2015-2023)

	Very Low Income		Low Income		Moderate Income		Above Moderate Income		Total	
	Obj.	Act.	Obj.	Act.	Obj.	Act.	Obj.	Act.	Obj.	Act.
Units Permitted	691	101	432	60	278	42	587	541	1,988	744
Units Rehabilitated	300	3	300	3						
Units to be Assisted	420	1600	485	1600	11		10			
Total										

A.2 REVIEW OF PAST ACCOMPLISHMENTS

TABLE A-2 REVIEW OF PAST ACCOMPLISHMENTS

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
H1 Goal – Ensure the Preservation of the Unique Character of Residential Neighborhoods		
H1.1.1	<p>Continue the citywide property maintenance, inspection and enforcement program.</p> <p><i>This program is intended to provide services which promote rehabilitation of substandard housing.</i></p>	<p>Since 2015, the city has provided rehabilitation services to six households.</p> <p>Based on the progress of this program, Program H.1.1 is appropriate to continue into the next housing cycle, with additional language added to identify target metrics and specific actions. This program is continued as part of Program 4.2 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
H1.1.2	<p>Consider modifying development standards for second units, where consistent with maintaining the character of existing neighborhoods. The modifications should encourage the production of second units affordable to very low-, low-, or moderate-income households.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to consider modification of the Zoning Code to provide for additional second units.</i></p>	<p>This action has been completed. The new Ordinance (5507) now in Palo Alto Municipal Code, Zoning Code Chapter 18.09, included streamlining the ADU process and providing certain exemptions for ADUs was adopted November 2020. Many of the City’s requirements went beyond State requirements. In September 2022, Planning and Transportation Committee (PTC) recommended updates to Chapter 18.09 to incorporate the 2022 state ADU legislation (AB2221 and SB897) and respond to Commission requests/ direction in 2021 and summer of 2022, including establishing rules for affordable ADUs. Council date December 12, 2022 is targeted for adoption.</p> <p>Based on the progress of this program, Program H1.1.2 does not need to be carried over to the next housing cycle because this is an ongoing adopted program in the City’s municipal code.</p>
H1.1.3	<p>Provide incentives to developers such as reduced fees and flexible development standards to encourage the preservation of existing rental cottages and duplexes currently located in the R-1 and R-2 residential areas.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to preserve 10 rental cottages and duplexes.</i></p>	<p>This program resulted in following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ The City did not rehabilitate or preserve any cottages or duplexes during the 5th Housing Cycle. ➤ Based on the progress of this program, Program H1.1.3 does not need to be carried over to the next housing cycle.

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
H2 Goal – Support the Construction of Housing Near Schools, Transit, Parks, Shopping, Employment, and Cultural Institutions		
H1.2.1	<p>When a loss of rental housing occurs due to subdivision or condominium conversion approvals, the project shall require 25 percent BMR units.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to provide 10 additional affordable housing units on sites where rental housing will be lost.</i></p>	<p>There have not been any projects subject to this program to date and it is not recommended that this program be carried over into the 6th Housing Cycle. However, City staff will continue enforcing this program as part of the City’s Condominium Conversion ordinance. In addition, preservation of at-risk housing is addressed in Program 5.1 and tenant protections are addressed in Program 6.6 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
H1.3.1	<p>Create community volunteer days and park cleanups, plantings, or similar events that promote neighborhood enhancement and conduct City sponsored cleanup campaigns for public and private properties.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to coordinate with the City’s waste and disposal hauler to conduct a cleanup campaign once a year to promote neighborhood clean-up.</i></p>	<p>The Clean Up Day system has been implemented and conducts appointment-based clean ups for residents. The program offers two clean up days a year, pre-scheduled, and the program encourages the collection of reusable items and partnered with GreenWaste of Palo Alto to find new homes for these items.</p> <p>This program should be carried over in the next housing element cycle. This program is included in Program 4.2.</p>
H2.1.1	<p>To allow for higher density residential development, consider amending the Zoning Code to permit high-density residential in mixed use or single use projects in commercial areas within one-half a mile of fixed rail stations and to allow limited exceptions to the 50-foot height limit for Housing Element Sites within one-quarter mile of fixed rail stations.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to provide opportunities for a diverse range of housing types near fixed rail stations.</i></p>	<p>This program was partially completed. The zoning code update was completed in January of 2019. Program 6.3 in the 6th Housing Cycle addresses incentives and promotion of mixed-use development near transit.</p>
H2.1.2	<p>Allow increased residential densities and mixed use development only where adequate urban services and amenities, including roadway capacity, are available.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to make sure that adequate services are available when considering increased residential densities.</i></p>	<p>The Zoning Code was amended in January 2019 to eliminate density restrictions in the CC(2) zone, and the CN and CS zoned properties along El Camino Real. The program was completed in January of 2019 as part of the Phase 1 Housing Element implementation plan for 2018. The Comprehensive Plan, adopted in 2018, and accompanying EIR, evaluated potential impacts to urban services and amenities, including roadway capacity. It identified improvements to be implemented in parallel with new housing and other development. The 6th Cycle Housing Element and the</p>

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
		<p>related CEQA analysis will evaluate the potential impacts of increased residential densities and identify necessary improvements.</p> <p>Based on the progress of this program and CEQA review related to this Housing Element, Program H2.1.2 is completed and not necessary to carry over into the next housing cycle.</p>
<p>H2.1.3</p>	<p>Amend the zoning code to specify the minimum density of eight dwelling units per acre in all RM-15 districts. Consider amending the zoning code to specify minimum density for other multifamily zoning districts, consistent with the multi-family land use designation in the Comprehensive Plan.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to provide opportunities for up to 10 additional dwelling units on properties zoned RM-15.</i></p>	<p>The Zoning Code was amended in January 2019 to allow for increased minimum residential densities in specified districts, including the RM districts, and increased maximum density for one RM zone (RM15 became RM20, 20 DUs/Acre). The program was completed as part of the Phase 1 Housing Element implementation plan for 2018.</p> <p>Based on the progress of this program, Program H2.1.3 is completed and not necessary to carry over into the next housing cycle.</p>
<p>H2.1.4</p>	<p>Amend the Zoning Code to create zoning incentives that encourage the development of smaller, more affordable housing units, including units for seniors, such as reduced parking requirements for units less than 900 square feet and other flexible development standards.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to provide opportunities for 75 smaller, more affordable housing units</i></p>	<p>This Zoning Code was amended in January 2019 to include reduced parking standards for smaller units: 1 space per “micro” units, defined as units of 450 sq. ft. or less, and 0.75 spaces per senior housing unit. Zoning Code changes also capped average unit size in the Downtown CD-C district to 1,500 sq. ft. The program was completed as part of the Phase 1 Housing Element implementation plan for 2018.</p> <p>Additionally, an ADU Ordinance to address ADU/JADU guidelines was adopted November 2020. The Planning and Transportation Commission recommended draft update to the ADU Chapter 18.09 establishing rules for affordable units and incorporating the 2022 State ADU legislation – Council is scheduled to adopt the updated ADU ordinance in December 2022.</p> <p>Program H2.1.4 is mostly completed and no longer appropriate to carry into the upcoming housing cycle. Program 6.5 in the 6th Cycle Housing Element supports the development of “micro-units” to accommodate extremely low-income households.</p>

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
H2.1.5	<p>Use sustainable neighborhood development criteria to enhance connectivity, walkability, and access to amenities, and to support housing diversity.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to increase connectivity and walkability in new development.</i></p>	<p>This program is partially complete. The North Ventura Coordinated Area Plan (NVCAP) is underway, which will support this program objective.</p> <p>This program is being addressed in the NVCAP, and therefore is not needed to be carried over to the next housing cycle.</p>
H2.1.6	<p>Consider density bonuses and/or concessions including allowing greater concessions for 100% affordable housing developments.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to provide opportunities for 100% affordable housing developments.</i></p>	<p>The Zoning Code was amended January 2019 to provide a local density bonus program, the Housing Incentive Program (HIP), as an alternative to State Density Bonus Law. The HIP allows Director-level approval of additional FAR (more than can be achieved under SDBL in most cases) and flexibility in development standards. The portion of the program was completed as part of the Phase 1 Housing Element implementation plan for 2018.</p> <p>In 2022, the City modified the Affordable Housing Overlay district into the Affordable Housing Incentive Program to streamline the approval process for projects with 100 percent affordable units. The new Incentive Program only requires review and approval by the ARB. If a project meets the affordability and location standards indicated here, it automatically qualifies for modified development standards, including increased FAR and height, reduced open space requirements, and reduced parking (0.75 space/unit by right, or as low as 0.3 space/unit with a parking study). This portion of the program was completed in June 2022 as part of the Objective Standards project.</p> <p>Based on the need for more affordable units and a high RHNA goal to reach, Program H2.1.6 is an important achievement. Program 3.4 in the 6th Housing Cycle seeks to expand development incentives and extend the HIP to residential and other districts.</p>

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
H2.1.7	<p>Explore developing a Transfer of Development Rights (TDR) program to encourage higher-density housing in appropriate locations.</p>	<p>This program was partially completed through implementation of the HIP (instead of TDR per se), which allowed for increased FARs and more flexible development standards, within commercial mixed-use districts near transit, and without legislative action. The program was completed in January of 2019 as part of the Phase 1 Housing Element implementation plan for 2018.</p> <p>Based on the implementation of the HIP, Program H2.1.7 is not appropriate to carry into the upcoming housing element cycle. Program 3.4 in the 6th Housing Cycle seeks to expand development incentives extend the HIP to residential districts.</p>
H2.1.8	<p>Promote redevelopment of underutilized sites by providing information about potential housing sites on the City’s website, including the Housing Sites identified to meet the RHNA and information about financial resources available through City housing programs.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to provide information to developers about potential housing sites.</i></p>	<p>The City of Palo Alto provides a housing opportunity map on its website that has identified locations for housing opportunity sites for the current housing cycle and small lot consolidation housing opportunity sites. Program 1.1 in the 6th Housing Cycle contains an action to continue to promote housing opportunity sites on the City’s website and update the inventory regularly.</p>
H2.1.9	<p>Amend the Zoning Code to create zoning incentives that encourage the consolidation of smaller lots identified as Housing Inventory Sites and developed with 100% affordable housing projects. Incentives may include development review streamlining, reduction in required parking for smaller units, or graduated density when consolidated lots are over one-half acre. Adopt amendments as appropriate. Provide information regarding zoning incentives to developers.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to amend the Zoning Code to provide development incentives to meet the RHNA.</i></p>	<p>The Zoning Code was amended in 2017 to include a list of incentives and standards for small lot consolidation, see Section 18.42.140 of the Zoning Code. The housing consolidation projects must be 100 percent affordable housing and deed-restricted for no fewer than 55 years.</p> <p>Program H2.1.9 will be revised to list other incentives to encourage small lot consolidation.</p>
H2.1.10	<p>As a part of planning for the future of El Camino Real, explore the identification of pedestrian nodes (i.e., “pearls on a string”) consistent with the South El Camino Design Guidelines, with greater densities in these nodes than in other areas.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to explore the identification of pedestrian nodes.</i></p>	<p>This program has not been completed. Program H2.1.10 has not yet been implemented but is not necessary to carry over to the next housing element. However, Program 3.4C in the 6th Cycle Housing Element continues with the intent of the Program H2.1.10.</p>

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
H2.1.11	<p>Consider implementing the Pedestrian and Transit Oriented Development (PTOD) Overlay for the University Avenue downtown district to promote higher density multifamily housing development in that area.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to provide opportunities for a diverse range of housing types near fixed rail stations.</i></p>	<p>This program is complete. The Zoning Code was amended to provide a local density bonus program, the HIP, in Downtown, among other sites. The HIP allows Director-level approval of additional FAR for multifamily housing developments. The program was completed in January 2019 as part of the Phase 1 Housing Element implementation plan for 2018.</p> <p>Program H2.1.11 has been completed and is not necessary to carry over to the next housing element.</p>
H2.1.12	<p>Evaluate developing specific or precise plans for the downtown, California Avenue, and El Camino Real areas to implement in the updated Comprehensive Plan. Adopt plans for these areas, as appropriate.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to Evaluate developing plans for downtown, California Avenue, and El Camino Real.</i></p>	<p>In February 2020, the ABAG Executive Board adopted Palo Alto University Avenue/Downtown Priority Development Area (PDA). The Comprehensive Plan includes policies calling for a coordinated study for Cal Ave and Downtown. In April 2022, the City approved a master funding agreement with MTC to initiate a master plan for Downtown. The Comprehensive Plan was adopted in 2018. Consultant selection in February 2023 by Council for the Downtown CAP is anticipated.</p> <p>Program H2.1.12 has been completed and therefore is not necessary to carry over into the next housing element.</p>
H2.2.1	<p>Implement an incentive program within three years of Housing Element adoption for small properties identified as a Housing Element Site to encourage housing production on those sites. The incentive eliminates Site and Design Review if the project meets the following criteria:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ The project has 9 residential units or fewer ➤ A residential density of 20 dwelling units per acre or higher ➤ Maximum unit size of 900 square feet <p><i>The objective of this program is to streamline processing for identified Housing Element Sites.</i></p>	<p>This program was adopted within three years of the Housing Element’s adoption and streamlined the process for identifying Housing Element Sites. Section 18.42.140 of Zoning Code provides incentives to encourage housing production of these small lot sites. However, no property owners/developers took advantage of the zoning incentives.</p> <p>Based on the lack of interest from developers, Program H2.2.1 is not necessary to carry over into the next housing cycle.</p>

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
H2.2.2	<p>Work with Stanford University to identify sites suitable for housing that may be located in the Stanford Research Park and compatible with surrounding uses.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to identify sites suitable for housing to accommodate additional housing units.</i></p>	<p>This program is underway. Palo Alto’s Comprehensive Plan 2030 contains programs within its land use element that explore additional housing opportunities.</p> <p>Based on the continued importance of site selection in the City, Program H2.2.2 is appropriate to carry into the upcoming housing element cycle. Program 1.6 in the 6th Housing Cycle addresses sites on Stanford University lands.</p>
H2.2.3	<p>Use coordinated area plans and other tools to develop regulations that support the development of housing above and among commercial uses.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to explore additional opportunities to encourage housing in commercial areas.</i></p>	<p>This program is partially complete. A Coordinated Area Plan (CAP) for the North Ventura neighborhood is expected to be completed in 2023. This plan includes policies and zoning regulations to support multifamily housing. Beginning a Downtown CAP is now possible as the 2022 PDA Grant allows the City to hire a consultant; consultant selection began in 2022. The City is also considering preparing a CAP for the California Ave. corridor.</p> <p>There are a number of programs in the 6th Housing Cycle that encourage housing in commercial areas. Program 2.1 addresses a reassessment of the residential and commercial housing development impact fee, Program 3.3 provides incentives to affordable housing developments in commercial areas, and Program 6.3 addresses incentives and promotion of mixed-use development near transit.</p>
H2.2.4	<p>As detailed in the Resources chapter of the Housing Element, the City of Palo Alto has committed to providing financial assistance towards the conversion of 23 multi-family units to very low-income (30-50% AMI) units for a period of 55 years, and is seeking to apply credits towards the City’s RHNA (refer to Appendix C - Adequate Sites Program Alternative Checklist). The Palo Alto Housing Corporation (PAHC) approached the City for assistance in converting a portion of the 60 units at the Colorado Park Apartments, to be reserved for very low-income households. The committed assistance will ensure affordability of the units for at least 55 years, as required by law.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is for the City to enter into a legally enforceable agreement for \$200,000 in committed assistance to purchase affordability covenants on 23 units at the</i></p>	<p>This program was completed in January 2016.</p> <p>Program H2.2.4 is complete and therefore it is not necessary to carry over into the next housing cycle.</p>

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
	<p><i>Colorado Park Apartments by the end of the second year of the housing element planning period.</i></p>	
<p>H2.2.5</p>	<p>The City will continue to identify more transit-rich housing sites including in the downtown and the California Avenue area after HCD certification as part of the Comprehensive Plan Update process and consider exchanging sites along San Antonio and sites along South El Camino that are outside of identified “pedestrian nodes” for the more transit-rich identified sites.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to explore additional appropriate housing sites.</i></p>	<p>This program is not yet complete. It was amended to include additional housing in the San Antonio corridor in November 2019. Based on the status of Program H2.2.5, components of this program are appropriate to continue into the upcoming housing element cycle. Program 1.1 in the 6th Housing Cycle addresses adequate sites to accommodate the City’s RHNA and Program 6.3 in the 6th Housing Cycle addresses incentives and promotion of mixed-use development near transit.</p>
<p>H2.2.6</p>	<p>On parcels zoned for mixed use, consider allowing exclusively residential use on extremely small parcels through the transfer of zoning requirements between adjacent parcels to create horizontal mixed-use arrangements. If determined to be appropriate, adopt an ordinance to implement this program.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to consider the transfer of zoning requirements to create horizontal mixed use.</i></p>	<p>The Zoning Code was amended in 2017 to include a list of incentives and standards for small lot consolidation, see Section 18.42.140 of Zoning Code. The housing consolidation projects must be 100% affordable housing and deed restricted for no fewer than 55 years. This includes mixed use projects containing ground floor retail and retail like use provided the residential square footage is at least 85 percent of the project's gross floor area.</p> <p>New standards were adopted into the Palo Alto Municipal Code; therefore, Program H2.2.6 is complete and not necessary to carry over into the next housing cycle.</p>
<p>H2.2.7</p>	<p>Explore requiring minimum residential densities to encourage more housing instead of office space when mixed-use sites develop, and adopt standards as appropriate.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to explore requiring minimum densities in mixed use districts.</i></p>	<p>The zoning code was updated in 2017 to allow residential-only projects within commercial mixed-use districts on El Camino Real and California Avenue, in addition to sites listed on the Housing Element sites inventory. In December 2018 the City added minimum densities to the RM-20, RM-30 and RM-40 zones. Additional updates in January 2019 eliminated maximum residential densities and increased potential FAR through the HIP program in most commercial mixed-use districts. These changes aimed to create incentives for housing over office space when commercial sites redevelop.</p> <p>New standards were adopted into the Palo Alto Municipal Code; therefore, Program H2.2.7 is complete and not necessary to carry over into the next housing cycle. However, Program 6.3 in the 6th Housing</p>

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
H2.2.8	<p>Assess the potential of removing maximum residential densities (i.e. dwelling units per acre) in mixed use zoning districts to encourage the creation of smaller housing units within the allowable Floor Area Ratio (FAR), and adopt standards as appropriate.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to assess the removal of maximum densities in mixed use zoning districts.</i></p>	<p>Cycle supports residential development in mixed-use zones.</p> <p>This program is complete. The zoning code was amended in December 2018 to add minimum densities in the RM-20, RM-30 and RM-40 zones, and to remove maximum residential density from the CC(2) zones and the CN and CS zones along El Camino Real. Zoning Code changes also capped average unit size in the Downtown CD-C district to 1,500 sq. ft. The program was completed in January of 2019 as part of the Phase 1 Housing Element implementation plan for 2018.</p> <p>Program 2.2.8 is complete and therefore is not necessary to carry over into the next housing element cycle.</p>
H3 Goal —Meet the Housing Needs and Provide Community Resources to Support our Neighbors		
H2.3.1	<p>Maintain an ongoing conversation with the community, using a variety of forms of media, regarding the need for affordable housing, the financial realities of acquiring land and building affordable housing, and the reasons that affordable housing projects need higher densities to be feasible developments.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to perform outreach on affordable housing.</i></p>	<p>This is an ongoing program. Efforts are underway to enhance outreach regarding affordable housing.</p> <p>This program should be carried over in the next housing element cycle. This program is incorporated into Program 6.7 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
H3.1.1	<p>Amend the City’s Below Market Rate (BMR) ordinance to lower the BMR requirement threshold from projects of five or more units to three or more units, and to modify the BMR rental section to be consistent with case law related to inclusionary rental housing.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to provide opportunities for four additional BMR units.</i></p>	<p>This program is complete. The BMR Ordinance was adopted on April 17, 2017.</p> <p>Program H3.1.1 is complete and therefore, it is not necessary to carry over into the next housing cycle.</p>
H3.1.10	<p>Annually monitor the progress in the construction or conversion of housing for all income levels, including the effectiveness of housing production in mixed use developments.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to provide information to the City Council on the effectiveness of City programs.</i></p>	<p>The City provides annual reports on the progress of this program, it is ongoing.</p> <p>Program 3.1.10 is ongoing and should be carried over in the next housing element cycle to keep the council informed on the effectiveness of City programs.</p>

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
H3.1.11	<p>When using Housing Development funds for residential projects, the City shall give a strong preference to those developments which serve extremely low-income (ELI), very low-income, and low-income households.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to provide funding opportunities for development of housing for Extremely Low Income households.</i></p>	<p>This program is ongoing and housing funds provided as needed by housing projects. The City permitted 101 housing units appropriate for very low-income households during the 5th Housing Cycle.</p> <p>Program 3.1.11 is carried over into Program 2.1 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
H3.1.12	<p>Amend the Zoning Code to provide additional incentives to developers who provide extremely low-income (ELI), very low-income, and low-income housing units, above and beyond what is required by the BMR program, such as reduced parking requirements for smaller units, reduced landscaping requirements, and reduced fees.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to provide incentives for development of housing for Extremely Low Income households.</i></p>	<p>In 2019 new development/parking standards were adopted in Housing Incentive Program for the commercial mixed-use district, (example: Zoning Code Section 18.16.060). This provided extra incentives for 100 percent BMR projects, including increased FAR, reduced parking, reduced setbacks and lot coverage, without legislative action.</p> <p>In 2022, the City modified the Affordable Housing Overlay district into the Affordable Housing Incentive Program to streamline the approval process for projects with 100% affordable units. The new Incentive Program only requires review and approval by the ARB. If a project meets the affordability and location standards indicated here, it automatically qualifies for modified development standards, including increased FAR and height, reduced open space requirements, and reduced parking (0.75 space/unit by right, or as low as 0.3 space/unit with a parking study). This portion of the program was completed in June 2022 as part of the Objective Standards project.</p> <p>Additional considerations for incentives for developers to construct BMR housing are included as actions in Program 2.2 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
H3.1.13	<p>For any affordable development deemed a high risk to convert to market rate prices within two years of the expiration of the affordability requirements, the City will contact the owner and explore the possibility of extending the affordability of the development.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to protect those affordable developments deemed a high risk to converting to market rate.</i></p>	<p>This program is partially complete. The City is in discussions with property owners of projects at risk of conversion in the next ten years, including Lytton Gardens, Terman Apartments, and Webster Wood Apartments.</p> <p>This program is carried over in the next housing cycle as Program 5.1 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
H3.1.14	<p>Encourage and support the regional establishment of a coordinated effort to provide shared housing arrangement facilitation, similar to the HIP Housing Home Sharing Program in San Mateo County. Advocate among regional and nonprofit groups to establish the necessary framework.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to meet with regional groups and work to establish a Santa Clara Home Sharing Program.</i></p>	<p>This program is partially complete. In April 2018, the Santa Clara County's Board approved the Santa Clara Home Sharing Program with partnership with Catholic Charities of Santa Clara County. However, the County program has since been disbanded.</p> <p>Encouragement of shared housing is carried over in the next housing cycle as an action in Program 6.5 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
H3.1.2	<p>Implement the BMR ordinance to reflect the City's policy of requiring: a) At least 15 percent of all housing units in projects must be provided at below market rates to very low-, low-, and moderate-income households. Projects on sites of five acres or larger must set aside 20 percent of all units as BMR units.</p> <p>Projects that cause the loss of existing rental housing may need to provide a 25 percent component as detailed in Program H 1.2.1. BMR units must be comparable in quality, size, and mix to the other units in the development. b) Initial sales price for at least two-thirds of the BMR units must be affordable to a household making 80 to 100 percent of the Santa Clara County median income. The initial sales prices of the remaining BMR units may be set at higher levels affordable to households earning between 100 to 120 percent of the County's median income. For projects with a 25 percent BMR component, four-fifths of the BMR units must be affordable to households.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to provide ten affordable units through implementation of the City's BMR program.</i></p>	<p>The BMR ordinance has been adopted. Additional considerations for incentives for developers to construct BMR housing are included as actions in Program 2.2 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
H3.1.3	<p>Continue implementation of the BMR Program Emergency Fund to prevent the loss of BMR units and to provide emergency loans for BMR unit owners to maintain and rehabilitate their units. Consider expansion of program funds to provide financial assistance for the maintenance and rehabilitation of older BMR units.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to use the BMR Program Emergency Fund to prevent the loss of at least two affordable units and assist in maintenance and rehabilitation of at least four older BMR units.</i></p>	<p>This is an ongoing program. One unit was preserved in 2016. Using CDBG funding for Safe and Sanitary, five homes were maintained in FY2018-19.</p> <p>Home rehabilitation for lower-income households is included as an action in Program 4.3 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
H3.1.4	<p>Preserve affordable housing stock by monitoring compliance, providing tenant education, and</p>	<p>This program is partially complete. The City is in discussions with property owners of</p>

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
	<p>seeking other sources of funds for affordable housing developments at risk of market rate conversions. The City will continue to renew existing funding sources supporting rehabilitation and maintenance activities.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to prevent conversion of affordable housing to market rate and renew funding sources for rehabilitation and maintenance of housing stock.</i></p>	<p>projects at risk of conversion, including Lytton Gardens, Terman Apartments and Webster Wood Apartments.</p> <p>Home rehabilitation for lower-income households is included as an action in Program 4.3 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p> <p>Protections for at-risk housing are included in Program 5.1 in the 6th Housing Cycle</p>
H3.1.5	<p>Encourage the use of flexible development standards, including floor area ratio limits, creative architectural solutions, and green building practices in the design of projects with a substantial BMR component.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to increase opportunities for BMR development through use of flexible development standards.</i></p>	<p>This program is complete. As detailed above, flexible development standards and additional FAR were made available for all multifamily housing projects and specifically for BMR housing projects through the Housing Incentive Program which was adopted in 2019 and the Affordable Housing Incentive Program which was adopted in 2022.</p> <p>This program is complete; therefore, it is not necessary to carry over into the next housing cycle. Additional considerations for incentives for developers to construct BMR housing are included as actions in Program 2.2 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
H3.1.6	<p>Require developers of employment generating commercial and industrial developments to contribute to the supply of low- and moderate-income housing through the payment of commercial in-lieu fees as set forth in a nexus impact fee study and implementing ordinances</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to generate in-lieu fees to contribute toward the creation of low- and moderate-income housing.</i></p>	<p>The in-lieu fee has been adopted and commercial developers are now paying a linkage fee. The City will continue to enforce and revise fee levels when necessary. This program is complete; therefore, it is not necessary to carry over into the next housing cycle.</p>
H3.1.7	<p>Ensure that the Zoning Code permits innovative housing types such as cohousing and provides flexible development standards that will allow such housing to be built, provided the character of the neighborhoods in which such housing is proposed to be located is maintained.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to review the Zoning Code and determine appropriate amendments to allow innovative housing types with flexible development standards that will allow such housing to be built, provided the character of the neighborhoods in which such housing is proposed to be located is maintained.</i></p>	<p>This program is not complete. It has been included in Housing Work Plan as Program 2.8.</p> <p>Program 3.1.7 is not complete; therefore, it is recommended that it is carried over to the next housing cycle. However, it is recommended that this program be consolidated with similar programs such as 3.1.5.</p> <p>Support for alternative types of housing is provided in Program 6.5 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
H3.1.8	<p>Recognize the Buena Vista Mobile Home Park as providing low- and moderate-income housing opportunities. Any redevelopment of the site</p>	<p>This program preserved 117 at-risk mobile home park units in September of 2017 in the Buena Vista Mobile Home Park. The City of</p>

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
	<p>must be consistent with the City’s Mobile Home Park Conversion Ordinance adopted to preserve the existing units. To the extent feasible, the City will seek appropriate local, state and federal funding to assist in the preservation and maintenance of the existing units in the Buena Vista Mobile Home Park.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to preserve the 120 mobile home units in the Buena Vista Mobile Home Park as a low and moderate income housing resource.</i></p>	<p>Palo Alto and SCCHA purchased the site to preserve it as an affordable living community.</p> <p>This program does not need to be carried over into the upcoming housing element update. This program was specific to the Buena Vista Mobile Home Park, which has been officially preserved since September of 2017.</p>
H3.1.9	<p>Continue enforcing the Condominium Conversion Ordinance.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to maintain the rental housing stock.</i></p>	<p>This program is not necessary to continue to the next housing element cycle because the objectives are already enforced by the Condominium Conversion Ordinance.</p>
H3.2.1	<p>Continue to assist very low-income households in reducing their utility bills through the Utilities Residential Rate Assistance Program (RAP).</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to provide assistance to 800 low-income on their households’ utility bills.</i></p>	<p>Program 3.2.1 has assisted approximately 400 households annually.</p> <p>This program is continued as a component of Program 6.4 in the 6th Housing Cycle for homelessness prevention.</p>
H3.2.2	<p>Use existing agency programs such as Senior Home Repair to provide rehabilitation assistance to very low and low-income households</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to provide rehabilitation assistance to 600 very low and low-income households.</i></p>	<p>Program 3.2.2 has led to the rehabilitation of six homes, which did not meet its goal of assisting 600 households.</p> <p>Home rehabilitation for lower-income households is included as an action in Program 4.3 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
H3.3.1	<p>When appropriate and feasible, require all City departments to expedite processes and allow waivers of development fees as a means of promoting the development of affordable housing.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to continue to reduce processing time and costs for affordable housing projects.</i></p>	<p>This program is ongoing.</p> <p>Streamlining of the development process is addressed in Program 3.2 of the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
H3.3.2	<p>Continue to exempt permanently affordable housing units from any infrastructure impact fees adopted by the City.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to reduce costs for affordable housing projects.</i></p>	<p>This program is continued as Policy 4.1 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
H3.3.3	<p>Promote legislative changes and funding for programs that subsidize the acquisition, rehabilitation, and operation of rental housing by housing assistance organizations, nonprofit developers, and for-profit developers.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to continue as an active member of the Non-Profit Housing Association of Northern California to promote legislative changes and funding.</i></p>	<p>Program 3.3.3 does not have any quantifiable objectives or reportable outcomes, and therefore is not carried over into the next housing cycle.</p>
H3.3.4	<p>Support the development and preservation of group homes and supported living facilities for persons with special housing needs by assisting local agencies and nonprofit organizations in the construction or rehabilitation of new facilities for this population.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to regularly review existing development regulations and amend the Zoning Code accordingly to reduce regulatory obstacles to this type of housing.</i></p>	<p>This program is carried over as Program 6.5 in the 6th Housing Cycle, with an action to review and amend the City’s zoning ordinance to address State legislation pertaining to group homes and reduce constraints to development.</p>
H3.3.5	<p>Review and consider revising development standards for second units to facilitate the development of this type of housing, including reduced minimum lot size and FAR requirements. Based on this analysis, consider modifications to the Zoning Code to better encourage development of second units.</p>	<p>This program is complete. A new Ordinance was adopted November 2020. In September 2022, the PTC recommended Council adopt an updated Zoning Chapter 18.09 to establishing rules for affordable units and incorporating the 2022 State ADU legislation. December 2022 Council is scheduled to adopt the updated ordinance.</p>
H3.3.6	<p>Continue to participate with and support agencies addressing homelessness.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to continue City staff participation in prioritizing funding for County-wide programs.</i></p>	<p>Program 3.3.6 is carried over as Program 6.4 in the 6th Housing Cycle and updated to address the relevant agencies and specific actions the City will take to support services related to people experiencing homelessness. In addition, the City has partnered with Lifemoves to construct Palo Alto Homekey, an emergency shelter that will service approximately 300 persons a year. It should be operational by August 2023.</p>
H3.3.7	<p>Prepare a local parking demand database to determine parking standards for different housing uses (i.e., market rate multifamily, multifamily affordable, senior affordable, emergency shelters etc.) with proximity to services as a consideration. Adopt revisions to standards as appropriate.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to determine parking standards for different residential uses.</i></p>	<p>This program is partially complete. A consultant has been retained to complete a parking study. The City will study the feasibility of marketing different housing typologies without on-site parking as an action in Program 6.5, and align parking requirements to be consistent with State Density Bonus law as an action in Program 3.4 of the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
H3.4.1	<p>Maintain a high priority for the acquisition of new housing sites near public transit and services, the acquisition and rehabilitation of existing housing, and the provision for housing-related services for affordable housing. Seek funding from all State and federal programs whenever they are available to support the development or rehabilitation of housing for very low-, low-, and moderate-income households.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to allocate CDBG funding to acquire and rehabilitate housing for very low-, low-, and moderate income households.</i></p>	<p>This program has led to the acquisition of one new housing site.</p> <p>Program 3.4.1 is continued as Programs 2.2 and 4.3 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
H3.4.2	<p>Support and expand local funding sources including the City’s Housing Development Fund, Housing Trust of Santa Clara County, CDBG Program, County of Santa Clara’s Mortgage Credit Certificate Program (MCC), or similar program. Continue to explore other mechanisms to generate revenues to increase the supply of low and moderate-income housing.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to increase the supply of affordable housing stock.</i></p>	<p>The City has applied and has been successfully awarded from State Homekey, Local Housing Trust Fund and Permanent Local Housing Allocation funds. These funds will help fund a future facility that will serve up to 300 persons annually and a 50-unit affordable project that serves low and very low income persons with disabilities. In addition, the City has already permitted 161 very low and low-income units during the 5th Housing Cycle. Program 3.4.2 is continued as Program 2.2 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
H3.4.3	<p>Periodically review the housing nexus formula required under Chapter 16.47 of the Municipal Code to fully reflect the impact of new jobs on housing demand and cost.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to continue to evaluate the housing nexus formula and adjust the required impact fees to account for the housing demand from new development.</i></p>	<p>The housing nexus study was updated in 2016. Development fees are evaluated and updated annually.</p> <p>The City will prepare an updated nexus and feasibility study as part of Program 2.1 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
H3.4.4	<p>The City will work with affordable housing developers to pursue opportunities to acquire, rehabilitate, and convert existing multi-family developments to long-term affordable housing units to contribute to the City’s fair share of the region’s housing needs.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to identify potential sites for acquisition and conversion and provide this information to developers.</i></p>	<p>The City used CDBG funds to rehabilitate a 60-unit affordable housing development, and provided funds toward the purchase of the City’s only mobile home park; rehabilitation of the coaches is ongoing. This program is continued as Program 2.2 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
H3.5.1	<p>Continue to participate in the Santa Clara County Homeless Collaborative as well as work with adjacent jurisdictions to develop additional shelter opportunities.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to continue City staff participation as members of the Collaborative’s CDBG and Home Program Coordinators Group.</i></p>	<p>This program is part of the normal function of the City’s existing Homeless Prevention Program. Opportunities for expansion on actions addressing homelessness are included in Program 6.4 of the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
H3.5.2	<p>Amend the Zoning Code to clarify distancing requirements for emergency shelters, stating that “no more than one emergency shelter shall be permitted within a radius of 300 feet.”</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to amend the Zoning Code to clarify distancing requirements for emergency shelters.</i></p>	<p>Program 3.5.2 is complete.</p> <p>Actions to address new emergency shelter requirements, and carried over to the next housing cycle.</p>
H3.5.3	<p>Amend the Zoning Code to revise definitions of transitional and supportive housing to remove reference to multiple-family uses, and instead state that “transitional and supportive housing shall be considered a residential use of property and shall be subject only to those restrictions that apply to other residential dwellings of the same type in the same zone.”</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to amend the Zoning Code to revise transitional and supportive housing definitions.</i></p>	<p>Program 3.5.3 is complete.</p> <p>Programs 6.1 and 6.3 address transitional and supportive housing during the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
H3.6.1	<p>Work with appropriate State and federal agencies to ensure that fair housing laws are enforced, and continue to support groups that provide fair housing services, such as the Mid-Peninsula Citizens for Fair Housing</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to create the opportunity for up to five units of workforce housing.</i></p>	<p>The City continued to engage with State, federal, and local support groups on fair housing enforcement.</p> <p>Program 3.6.1 is a requirement of State law and therefore not necessary as a separate program; it should not be carried over to the next housing cycle.</p>
Goal 4 – Promote an Environment Free of Discrimination and the Barriers that Prevent Choice in Housing		
H4.1.2	<p>Continue the efforts of the Human Relations Commission to combat discrimination in rental housing, including mediation of problems between landlords and tenants.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to implement existing ordinances regarding discrimination cases.</i></p>	<p>41 households were assisted with fair housing services during the 5th Housing Cycle. The City will continue to contract with Project Sentinel to provide mediation services, included as an action in Program 6.6. (Fair Housing) in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
<p>H4.1.3</p>	<p>Continue implementation of City’s ordinances and State law prohibiting discrimination in renting or leasing housing based on age, parenthood, pregnancy, or the potential or actual presence of a minor child.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to continue to provide funding and other support for these groups to disseminate fair housing information in Palo Alto.</i></p>	<p>41 households were assisted with fair housing services during the 5th Housing Cycle. Fair housing services and outreach are components of Program 6.6. (Fair Housing) in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
<p>H4.1.4</p>	<p>Continue the City’s role in coordinating the actions of various support groups that seek to eliminate housing discrimination and in providing funding and other support for these groups to disseminate fair housing information in Palo Alto, including information on referrals to pertinent investigative or enforcement agencies in the case of fair housing complaints.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to continue to provide funding and other support for these groups to disseminate fair housing information in Palo Alto.</i></p>	<p>Fair housing services and outreach are components of Program 6.6. (Fair Housing) in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
<p>H4.1.5</p>	<p>Heighten community awareness regarding and implement the Reasonable Accommodations procedure for the siting, funding, development, and use of housing for people with disabilities.</p> <p><i>The intention of this program is to continue to provide information to residents on reasonable accommodation procedures via public counters and on the City’s website.</i></p>	<p>The city continued to enforce reasonable accommodation requirements such as granting land use exceptions to meet the reasonable accommodation request. To create a process for making requests for reasonable accommodation to land use and zoning decisions and procedures regulating the siting, funding, development, and use of housing for people with disabilities, The City adopted a reasonable accommodation process ordinance in January of 2014. The codified ordinance is available at all counters where applications are made for permits and licenses, and on the City’s website. The outreach component of Program 4.1.5 to increase awareness of rights and services is included as an action in Program 6.6. (Fair Housing) in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
<p>H4.1.6</p>	<p>Continue to implement the Action Plan of the City of Palo Alto’s Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) Consolidated Plan and the Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to provide for increased use and support of tenant/landlord educational mediation opportunities as called for in the CDBG Action Plan and the Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice.</i></p>	<p>The city accomplished this program by continuing to partner with Project Sentinel to provide education and enforcement fair housing law. 41 households were assisted with fair housing services.</p> <p>Program 4.1.6 is continued as an action in Program 6.6. (Fair Housing) in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
H4.2.1	<p>Ensure that the Zoning Code facilitates the construction of housing that provides services for special needs households and provides flexible development standards for special service housing that will allow such housing to be built with access to transit and community services while preserving the character of the neighborhoods in which they are proposed to be located.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to evaluate the Zoning Code and develop flexible development standards for special service housing.</i></p>	<p>This program is not yet complete. The City implemented a pilot Safe Parking Program for people experiencing homeless. It is included as Housing Work Plan Program 2.4.7.</p> <p>Program 4.2.1 is carried over to the next housing cycle as an action in Programs 6.1 and 6.4 of the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>
H4.2.2	<p>Work with the San Andreas Regional Center to implement an outreach program that informs families in Palo Alto about housing and services available for persons with developmental disabilities. The program could include the development of an informational brochure, including information on services on the City’s website, and providing housing-related training for individuals/families through workshops.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to provide information regarding housing to families of persons with developmental disabilities, and to develop an outreach program within three years of adoption.</i></p>	<p>This program is not yet complete. This program will not be carried over as written.</p> <p>The City will contract with and financially support non-profit services providers, such as the Opportunity Center, that help meet the supportive services needs of the City’s diverse community, especially those with extremely low incomes, as part of Program 6.1 in the 6th Housing Cycle</p>
H5 Goal – Reduce the Environmental Impact of New and Existing Housing		
H5.1.1	<p>Periodically report on the status and progress of implementing the City’s Green Building Ordinance and assess the environmental performance and efficiency of homes in the following areas:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Greenhouse gas emissions ➤ Energy use ➤ Water use (indoor and outdoor) ➤ Material efficiency ➤ Storm water runoff ➤ Alternative transportation <p><i>The objective of this program is to prepare reports evaluating the progress of implementing the City’s Green Building Ordinance.</i></p>	<p>Program 5.1.1 is a routine staff function, and therefore is not carried over to the next housing cycle.</p>

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
H5.1.2	<p>Continue providing support to staff and the public (including architects, owners, developers and contractors) through training and technical assistance in the areas listed under Program H5.1.1.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to provide educational information regarding the City's Green Building Ordinance.</i></p>	<p>Program 5.1.2 is a routine staff function, and therefore is not carried over to the next housing cycle.</p>
H5.1.3	<p>Participate in regional planning efforts to ensure that the Regional Housing Needs Allocation targets areas that support sustainability by reducing congestion and greenhouse gas emissions.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to Provide a regional framework for sustainability in creating new housing opportunities through the City's Regional Housing Mandate Committee.</i></p>	<p>Program 5.1.3 does not have any reportable accomplishments and is amended as part of Program 1.1 in the 6th Housing Cycle to identify adequate sites that meet State housing law.</p>
H5.1.4	<p>Review federal, State, and regional programs encouraging the improvement of environmental performance and efficiency in construction of buildings, and incorporate appropriate programs into Palo Alto's policies, programs and outreach efforts.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to continue to update regulations for environmental sustainability.</i></p>	<p>Program 5.1.4 is a routine staff function, and therefore is not carried over into the next housing cycle.</p>
H5.1.5	<p>Enhance and support a proactive public outreach program to encourage Palo Alto residents to conserve resources and to share ideas about conservation.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to provide up-to-date information for residents regarding conservation through educational brochures available at City Hall and posted on the City's website.</i></p>	<p>This program has led to the development of zero waste and energy efficiency and conservation. Palo Alto has its own public utility, which offers information and rebates for installation of water conservation and energy conservation systems and appliances. The City's Zero Waste division similarly offers resources for reducing trash, increasing diversion rates, and opportunities for disposal of hazardous household waste. These resources are available at the City's offices and on the City's website. Program 5.1.5 is ongoing and therefore is not carried over to the next housing cycle. The City will implement energy conservation and sustainability approaches for residential rehabilitation as directed by Policy 1.1 in the 6th Housing Cycle.</p>

Program	Description and Objectives	Progress and Continued Appropriateness
H5.1.6	<p>Provide financial subsidies, recognition, or other incentives to new and existing homeowners and developers to achieve performance or efficiency levels beyond minimum requirements.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to continue to recognize homeowners and developers who incorporate sustainable features beyond what is required by the Green Building Ordinance.</i></p>	<p>This program is with the City’s Utilities Department, which offers rebates and pilot programs such as the new heat pump water heater program launched in late 2022; Utilities efforts are ongoing and Planning is working with Utilities to streamline and remove Zoning Code obstacles to efficiency improvements.</p> <p>Program 5.1.6 does not have reportable accomplishments from Planning other than collaborating with Utilities, and therefore is not carried over to the next housing cycle.</p>
H5.1.7	<p>In accordance with Government Code Section 65589.7, immediately following City Council adoption, the City will deliver to all public agencies or private entities that provide water or sewer services to properties within Palo Alto a copy of the 2015-2023 Housing Element.</p> <p><i>The objective of this program is to, immediately following adoption, deliver the 2015-2023 Palo Alto Housing Element to all providers of sewer and water services within the City.</i></p>	<p>Program H 5.1.7 was completed upon the adoption of the 5th Cycle Housing Element. This action is not a program, therefore is continued into the next housing cycle.</p>

This page intentionally left blank.